Gary A. Dodge, #0897 Phillip R. Russell, #10445 HATCH, JAMES & DODGE 10 West Broadway, Suite 400 Salt Lake City, UT 84101 Telephone: 801-363-6363 Facsimile: 801-363-6666

Facsimile: 801-363-6666 Email: gdodge@hjdlaw.com prussell@hjdlaw.com

Attorneys for TracFone Wireless, Inc.

Mitchell F. Brecher Debra McGuire Mercer GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP 2101 L Street, NW, Suite 1000 Washington, DC 20037

Telephone: 202-331-3100 Facsimile: 202-261-0152 Email: brecherm@gtlaw.com mercerdm@gtlaw.com

#### BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION OF UTAH

Request of TracFone Wireless, Inc. to Amend its Designation as an Eligible Telecommunications Carrier to Receive Utah Universal Service Fund Support for Lifeline Service

Docket No. 17-2511-01

### DIRECT TESTIMONY OF DAVID AVILA ON BEHALF OF TRACFONE WIRELESS, INC.

TracFone Wireless, Inc. ("TracFone") hereby submits the Direct Testimony of David Avila in this docket.

DATED this 17th day of April 2018.

Respectfully submitted,

Gary A. Dodge Phillip J. Russell

HATCH, JAMES & DODGE, P.C.

Prince Dursell

Mitchell F. Brecher Debra McGuire Mercer GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP

Counsel for TracFone Wireless, Inc.

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I CERTIFY that on April 17, 2018, a true and correct copy of the Direct Testimony of David Avila on Behalf of TracFone Wireless, Inc. was delivered upon the following as indicated below:

#### DIVISION OF PUBLIC UTILITIES

Patricia Schmid pschmid@agutah.gov
Justin Jetter jjetter@agutah.gov
Chris Parker chrisparker@utah.gov
Bill Duncan wduncan@utah.gov
Casey Coleman ccoleman@utah.gov

#### OFFICE OF CONSUMER SERVICES

Steven Snarr stevensnarr@agutah.gov
Robert Moore rmoore@agutah.gov
Michele Beck mbeck@utah.gov
Cheryl Murray cmurray@utah.gov

/s/ Phillip J. Russell

#### BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION OF UTAH

Request of TracFone Wireless, Inc. to Amend its Designation as an Eligible Telecommunications Carrier to Receive Utah Universal Service Fund Support for Lifeline Service

Docket No. 17-2511-01

## DIRECT TESTIMONY OF DAVID AVILA ON BEHALF OF TRACFONE WIRELESS, INC.

- 1 Q: PLEASE STATE YOUR NAME, YOUR POSITION WITH TRACFONE
- 2 WIRELESS, INC., AND YOUR BUSINESS ADDRESS.
- 3 A: My name is David Avila. I am Associate Vice President II for Lifeline Services at
- TracFone Wireless, Inc. ("TracFone"). My business address is 9700 N.W. 112<sup>th</sup> Avenue,
- 5 Miami, Florida, 33178.
- 6 Q: PLEASE BRIEFLY DESCRIBE YOUR BACKGROUND AND
- 7 **QUALIFICATIONS.**
- 8 A: I have worked over 30 years in the telecommunications field, primarily in product
- 9 development, management, operations, marketing, sales and compliance roles. I have
- worked for TracFone for the past two years as Associate Vice President II for Lifeline
- 11 Services. I have worked in the Lifeline segment since 2009 when I supported the
- creation and launch of Sprint's Assurance Wireless Lifeline service. I held various
- positions at Assurance Wireless from the company's growth and expansion periods of
- 14 2009 through 2015 when I joined TracFone to lead its SafeLink Wireless® Lifeline
- service.
- 16 Q: PLEASE DESCRIBE YOUR CURRENT POSITION AND RESPONSIBILITIES.
- 17 A: As Associate Vice President II for Lifeline Services, I am responsible for managing
- several aspects of TracFone's Lifeline service throughout the United States, including
- 19 product development, operations, marketing, sales and compliance.
- 20 Q: WHAT IS TRACFONE?
- 21 A: TracFone is a wholly-owned subsidiary of América Móvil, one of largest wireless
- telecommunications carriers in the world. TracFone is a reseller of commercial mobile
- radio service ("CMRS") throughout the United States, including the State of Utah.

TracFone provides resold wireless telecommunications service consisting of services obtained from licensed operators of wireless networks. As a CMRS provider, TracFone is regulated as a telecommunications common carrier, subject to all applicable regulations. TracFone is currently the nation's leading provider of prepaid wireless telecommunications services, and one of the largest wireless carriers overall, with 22.7 million subscribers nationwide. TracFone has been designated an Eligible Telecommunications Carrier ("ETC") for the purpose of providing Lifeline service to low-income households in over 40 states, including Utah.

#### Q: DOES TRACFONE HAVE A PRESENCE IN UTAH?

**A**:

**A**:

TracFone is incorporated under the laws of the State of Delaware and is headquartered at Miami, Florida. Its corporate offices are located at 9700 N.W. 112<sup>th</sup> Avenue, Miami, Florida, 33178. TracFone has provided CMRS throughout the State of Utah continuously for more than fifteen years. In Utah, TracFone obtains service from the following underlying carriers: AT&T Wireless, T-Mobile, and Verizon Wireless. TracFone's arrangements with those providers enable it to offer services wherever any of those providers offer service in Utah.

#### Q: DOES TRACFONE CURRENTLY PROVIDE LIFELINE SERVICE IN UTAH?

Yes. TracFone has provided qualifying low-income residents in Utah with Lifeline service for over seven years. On December 1, 2010, the Public Service Commission of Utah ("Commission") issued an Order designating TracFone as an ETC. (See In the Matter of the Petition of TracFone Wireless, Inc. for Designation as an Eligible Telecommunications Carrier in the State of Utah for the Limited Purpose of Offering Lifeline Service to Qualified Customers, Amended Report and Order and Order on

1		Request for Limited Reconsideration, Docket No. 09-2511-01, December 1, 2010 ("ETC
2		Order"), aff'd on recons., Order on Reconsideration, March 9, 2011) The Commission
3		stated in the ETC Order that TracFone's ETC designation was subject to several explicit
4		conditions, including the following: "TracFone shall receive no state USF support. If it
5		desires state USF, it shall submit a new application requesting such support." (ETC
6		$\underline{\text{Order}}, \P 21)$
7	Q:	DID TRACFONE SUBMIT A PETITION TO AMEND ITS DESIGNATION AS
8		AN ELIGIBLE TELECOMMUNICATIONS CARRIER?
9	<b>A:</b>	Yes. On June 23, 2017, TracFone filed a petition with the Commission to amend its
10		designation as an ETC to include authorization to receive Utah Universal Public
11		Telecommunications Service Support Fund ("Utah USF") support for Lifeline service
12		within the State of Utah.
13	Q:	DID TRACFONE FILE AN AMENDED PETITION TO AMEND ITS
14		DESIGNATION AS AN ETC?
15	<b>A:</b>	Yes. On April 16, 2018, TracFone filed an amended petition ("Amended Petition").
16	Q:	WHY DID TRACFONE FILE AN AMENDED PETITION?
17	<b>A:</b>	The Amended Petition addresses issues that were not present in June 2017 when
18		TracFone initially filed a petition seeking to amend its designation as an ETC to include
19		authorization to receive Utah USF support.
20	Q:	PLEASE DESCRIBE THE ISSUES THAT OCCURRED WHICH LED
21		TRACFONE TO FILE AN AMENDED PETITION.
22	<b>A:</b>	At the time TracFone filed its petition, the Commission was conducting a rulemaking
23		proceeding to promulgate rules governing wireless ETCs' eligibility to receive Utah USF

support. As of June 23, 2017, the date TracFone filed its petition, the Commission had drafted proposed rules regarding the Utah USF, but had not adopted them. On June 30, 2017, the Commission issued an order staying TracFone's petition until the Commission promulgated rules. On February 21, 2018, the Commission's new rules governing the Utah USF became effective, and on March 6, 2018, the Commission issued an order lifting the stay.

**A**:

A:

TracFone filed its Amended Petition to address issues that were not present in June 2017 when it initially filed a petition seeking to amend its designation as an ETC to include authorization to receive Utah USF support. Specifically, in the fall of 2018, TracFone introduced a new Lifeline plan that provides a discount to Lifeline-eligible consumers enrolled in the Walmart Family Mobile® Financial Assistance Program. In addition, as I stated earlier, the Commission promulgated new rules governing the Utah USF that had an effective date of February 21, 2018.

## 14 Q: HOW DOES TRACFONE'S AMENDED PETITION DIFFER FROM THE 15 PETITION IT FILED ON JUNE 23, 2017?

The only substantive differences are that the Amended Petition describes how TracFone meets the Commission's current rules governing eligibility to receive Utah USF support and provides information regarding the Financial Assistance Program available to Lifeline-eligible Walmart Family Mobile® customers.

#### 20 Q: WHAT IS THE PURPOSE OF YOUR TESTIMONY TODAY?

The testimony I am providing today focuses on TracFone's request for approval to receive Utah USF support. As I will explain in my testimony, TracFone meets the Commission's requirements for receipt of Utah USF support.

#### Q: WHAT LIFELINE SERVICES WILL TRACFONE OFFER TO QUALIFYING

UTAH CONSUMERS IF THE COMMISSION APPROVES TRACFONE'S

#### REQUEST TO RECEIVE UTAH USF SUPPORT?

A:

A:

If TracFone's Amended Petition is approved and TracFone is allowed to receive funds from the Utah USF, it will use the \$3.50 per customer per month in state support to provide every customer enrolled in its SafeLink Wireless® Lifeline service with an additional 400 minutes per month in wireless voice service airtime above the amount customers receive under the federal Lifeline program (for a total of 750 no charge minutes) and to provide an increased discount to customers enrolled in the Walmart Family Mobile® Financial Assistance Program. In my testimony below, I describe the details of these plans.

## Q: PLEASE DESCRIBE THE ENHANCED SAFELINK WIRELESS® LIFELINE PLAN.

TracFone will offer SafeLink Wireless® Lifeline customers in Utah a bundled mobile broadband data and voice plan that includes 750 airtime minutes and 1 GB of mobile broadband data service at a minimum of 3G speed. The voice portion of the bundled plan will include unlimited text messages, voicemail, caller ID, national long distance calling without toll charges, and no charges for roaming. New SafeLink Wireless® Lifeline customers who enroll in Lifeline via an authorized sales agent will need to use their own smartphone to receive Lifeline service. New SafeLink Wireless® Lifeline customers who enroll in Lifeline via TracFone's website or by calling TracFone will have the option of receiving a free Android smartphone from TracFone that is Wi-Fi-capable, or using their own smartphone. Those SafeLink Wireless® customers who provide their own

smartphone will receive an additional 500 MB of data, for a total of 1.5 GB of data, for the first three months for which they are Lifeline bundled data and voice customers. Those Lifeline customers will then receive 1 GB of data starting with the fourth month of service.

## Q: WILL THE ENHANCED SAFELINK WIRELESS® LIFELINE PLAN BE AVAILABLE TO TRACFONE'S CURRENT VOICE-ONLY SAFELINK WIRELESS® CUSTOMERS?

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

A:

No. TracFone has a small subset of current SafeLink Wireless® customers who receive voice-only Lifeline service that provides 1,000 airtime minutes and unlimited texting each month. Those customers were enrolled in TracFone's SafeLink Wireless® program prior to December 2, 2016. That was the effective date of the Federal Communications Commission ("FCC") rules, which modernized the Lifeline program to support broadband service. Prior to that date, TracFone provided its Lifeline consumers with wireless phones, but not smartphones. Such devices were not suitable for broadband Internet access. For that reason, those "legacy" customers remained enrolled in a voiceonly program which meets the FCC's minimum service standards for voice service. A voice-only plan does not qualify for Utah USF support. However, any TracFone current voice-only Lifeline customers who decide to change their plan to the bundled voice and mobile broadband data plan will receive the enhanced Lifeline benefits supported by the Utah USF. Such customers will need to bring their own smartphone to receive bundled voice and data SafeLink Wireless® Lifeline service. They will receive an additional 500 MB of mobile broadband data service for the first three months for which they are Lifeline bundled voice and mobile broadband data customers.

1 Q: WILL THE ENHANCED SAFELINK WIRELESS® LIFELINE PLAN COM
---

WITH THE COMMISSION'S RULES GOVERNING ELIGIBILITY TO

#### RECEIVE UTAH USF SUPPORT?

**O**:

A:

A: Yes. TracFone's enhanced bundled mobile broadband data and voice Lifeline service will meet the Commission's minimum service standard for receipt of Utah USF support because it will provide 750 wireless voice minutes and unlimited texting for no additional charge and will comply with FCC requirements for broadband Lifeline service. The FCC's rules, effective December 1, 2017, require mobile broadband data service providers to offer at least 1 GB of mobile broadband data service at a minimum of 3G speed to qualify for broadband federal Lifeline support. As I stated earlier, the mobile broadband data portion of TracFone's bundled voice and data Lifeline service includes 1 GB of data at a minimum of 3G speed.

# HOW WILL THE ENHANCED SAFELINK WIRELESS® LIFELINE PLAN DIFFER FROM THE CURRENT SAFELINK WIRELESS® LIFELINE PLAN OFFERED TO QUALIFYING UTAH CONSUMERS?

TracFone's standard bundled mobile broadband data and voice Lifeline service includes 350 voice minutes and 1 GB of data each month in all states where TracFone does not receive state USF support. Under the enhanced bundled voice and mobile broadband data plan for Utah, TracFone's Utah SafeLink Wireless® Lifeline consumers will receive an additional 400 minutes per month above the number of minutes that would be available under its Utah plan supported solely by the federal Universal Service Fund ("USF") without Utah USF support. TracFone's provision of an additional 400 voice minutes in its bundled voice and mobile broadband data service for a total of 750 voice

4		ASSISTA	ANC	E PROGRAM?				
3	Q:	WHAT	IS	TRACFONE'S	WALMART	<b>FAMILY</b>	MOBILE®	FINANCIAL
2		of the additional support from the Utah USF.						
1		minutes v	vill e	ensure that TracFo	ne's Utah Lifeli	ne customer	s will receive	the full benefit

A:

A:

TracFone recently began offering a Lifeline discount for customers of its Walmart Family Mobile® brand in all states in which TracFone provides Lifeline service, except California. This program, known as the Financial Assistance Program, was deployed for the first time in October 2017, and was not available in any state at the time the initial petition was filed in this case. The Financial Assistance Program is distinct from and does not impact the terms and conditions of the bundled voice and data service offered to TracFone's SafeLink Wireless® Lifeline customers.

## 12 Q: PLEASE DESCRIBE THE LIFELINE BENEFITS OFFERED UNDER THE 13 FINANCIAL ASSISTANCE PROGRAM.

Under the Financial Assistance Program, which is funded by the federal USF Lifeline program, Lifeline-eligible customers of Walmart Family Mobile® can receive a monthly discount of \$9.25 on the purchase of any eligible monthly service plan that meets the federal minimum service standards for Lifeline service set forth in 47 C.F.R. § 54.408. However, upon the Commission's approval of TracFone's request to receive Utah USF support, TracFone will increase the amount of the discount by \$3.50 so that the total discount will be \$12.75.

1	Q:	WHICH WALMART FAMILY MOBILE® PLANS MEET THE FEDERAL
2		MINIMUM SERVICE STANDARDS FOR LIFELINE SERVICE?
3	A:	Currently, all Walmart Family Mobile® plans meet the federal minimum service
4		standards. These plans include the following:
5		1. For \$24.88 Unlimited Talk, Text and Data, with the first 1GB at 4G LTE speed, then
6		at 2G speed.
7		2. For \$29.88 Unlimited Talk, Text and Data, with the first 3GB at 4G LTE speed, then
8		at 2G speed.
9		3. For \$39.88 Unlimited Talk, Text and Data, with the first 9GB at 4G LTE speed, then
10		2G speed.
11		4. For \$49.88 Unlimited Talk, Text and Data, with unlimited data at 4G LTE Speed.
12	Q:	HOW MUCH WILL A CUSTOMER WHO QUALIFIES FOR THE FINANCIAL
13		ASSISTANCE PROGRAM PAY FOR A WALMART FAMILY MOBILE® PLAN?
14	A:	Financial Assistance Program customers receive a discount of \$9.25 per month off of the
15		listed retail price to reduce the cost of their Walmart Family Mobile® monthly phone
16		service. Those customers who qualify for the Financial Assistance Program will receive
17		a \$12.75 discount off of the retail prices listed above if the Commission authorizes
18		TracFone to receive Utah USF support.

1	Q:	WHAT ARE THE REQUIREMENTS FOR RECEIPT OF UTAH USF SUPPORT?
2	A:	The requirements for eligibility to receive Utah USF support are set forth in Section 54-
3		8b-15 of the Utah Code and R746-8-403 of the Utah Administrative Code. As I will
4		explain in my testimony, TracFone meets each of these requirements.
5	Q:	IS TRACFONE ELIGIBLE TO RECEIVE UTAH USF SUPPORT UNDER
6		SECTION 54-8b-15 OF THE UTAH CODE?
7	A;	Yes. Section 54-8b-15(15) provides that "[a] facilities-based or nonfacilities-based
8		wireless telecommunications provider is eligible for distributions from the Universal
9		Telecommunications Service Support Fund under the lifeline program" TracFone,
10		as a nonfacilities-based wireless telecommunications provider, is eligible for distributions
11		from the Utah USF to support its Lifeline service.
12	Q:	DOES TRACFONE MEET THE REQUIREMENTS FOR RECEIPT OF UTAH
13		USF SET FORTH IN R746-8-403?
14	A:	Yes. R746-8-403 includes conditions for receipt of Utah USF support that are applicable
15		to all ETCs, as well as minimum service standards that are applicable to wireless ETCs.
16		TracFone meets each of these conditions.   The Commission's rules provide that "an
17		ETC may receive an ongoing distribution through ongoing participation in a
18		Commission-approved Lifeline program upon a specific finding of public interest by the
19		Commission." As I will explain later in my testimony, amendment of TracFone's ETC
20		designation to include authorization to receive Utah USF support will serve the public
21		interest.
22		R746-8-403(2) of the Utah Administrative Code further provides that Utah USF
23		support "may not exceed \$3.50 per Lifeline subscriber per month of subscription to a

service" that meets certain minimum service standards. Specifically, the Lifeline service must (1) meet FCC Lifeline requirements for broadband set forth in 47 C.F.R. § 54.408 and "for wireless Lifeline, allow[s], at no charge beyond the basic monthly fee, unlimited texting and at least 750 voice minutes per month" or (2) meet FCC requirements for broadband set forth in 47 C.F.R. § 54.408 and not include a voice component. I testified earlier that TracFone's enhanced Lifeline plans meet the first prong of the minimum service standards by offering mobile broadband Internet access service that meets the FCC's standards, unlimited texting, and at least 750 airtime minutes for no additional charge to Lifeline-eligible consumers.

**A**:

**A**:

## 10 Q: WILL TRACFONE COMPLY WITH THE COMMISSION'S RULES 11 GOVERNING ETCS THAT ARE APPROVED TO RECEIVE UTAH USF 12 SUPPORT FOR LIFELINE SERVICE?

Yes. TracFone will comply with the Commission's rules governing ETCs that are approved to participate in Utah's Lifeline program. In particular, TracFone will fulfill the duties as detailed in R746-8-403(3) and (4). Those duties include: providing potential Lifeline subscribers with application materials and information; verifying the eligibility of Lifeline applicants using the FCC's national verifier system or, if the national verifier system is not operational, through Utah's Lifeline program administrator; submitting a Lifeline subscriber list to the Division of Public Utilities by May 1 each year; and neither requiring nor prohibiting a Lifeline subscriber from purchasing additional services from the ETC.

## 21 Q: WHY IS IT IN THE PUBLIC INTEREST FOR TRACFONE TO RECEIVE 22 DISBURSEMENTS FROM THE UTAH USF?

Expansion of TracFone's designation as an ETC to include Utah USF support will serve the public interest, as required by R746-8-403(1) of the Commission's rules, by enabling

TracFone to provide enhanced Lifeline benefits to Utah Lifeline customers. Those enhanced Lifeline benefits will provide a valuable alternative to the existing Lifeline services available to low-income Utah households. Specifically, TracFone's receipt of Utah USF support will benefit low-income Utah consumers by increasing the number of Lifeline providers able to use the additional Utah USF support to offer enhanced Lifeline service. TracFone's offer of additional airtime minutes to SafeLink Wireless® customers will better enable those customers to obtain calling capacity sufficient to meet all their telecommunications requirements. Utah Lifeline consumers will have more minutes to contact (or be contacted by) current and prospective employers, health care providers, government services, and most importantly, to remain in contact with family members and friends. Similarly, TracFone's offer of an increased discount to qualifying Walmart Family Mobile® customers will allow customers to choose the bundled voice and mobile broadband data plan that best meets their needs while making the cost of the plan more affordable. No other Lifeline provider operating in Utah offers consumers choices which include no charge Lifeline services such as the SafeLink Wireless® program and plans which include discounts off of paid services such as the Walmart Family Mobile<sup>®</sup> plans. Moreover, TracFone's enhanced Lifeline service will better meet the overwhelming demand of Utah Lifeline households for wireless Lifeline service over wireline Lifeline service. As of December 2017, 40.7 percent of all ETCs receiving federal USF support in Utah and serving non-Tribal lands are wireless carriers. However, those wireless carriers received 87 percent of the federal USF support distributed to Utah carriers serving non-Tribal lands in 2017. Those data demonstrate the large and growing demand by low-income Utah households residing on non-Tribal lands for wireless Lifeline

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

services. Low-income Utah residents would benefit from increased competition within the Lifeline service market. Increased competition leads to additional consumer choices and delivery of greater value services to consumers.

If the Commission authorizes TracFone to receive Utah USF support, then TracFone will be able to deliver enhanced service choices and greater value to qualifying Utah households as described in this Amended Petition.

## **Q:** IS THERE ANYTHING ELSE YOU WOULD LIKE TO ADD TO YOUR 8 TESTIMONY?

Based on my testimony above, TracFone meets all applicable legal requirements for receipt of Utah USF support. The Commission's approval of this petition so as to enable TracFone to provide Utah SafeLink Wireless® Lifeline customers with 400 minutes per month of additional service and provide Utah Financial Assistance Program participants with an increased Walmart Family Mobile® Lifeline discount would serve the public interest. Accordingly, the Utah Public Service Commission should unconditionally and promptly grant TracFone's Amended Petition to amend its designation as an ETC to include approval to receive Utah USF support for Lifeline service provided to its Utah Lifeline customers.

#### 18 Q. DOES THIS CONCLUDE YOUR TESTIMONY?

**A.** Yes it does.

A: